

Memory Wars

Part I: Poland and Russia

Part II: Ukraine and Russia Before the Invasion

Review: When do memory wars occur?

- Opposing or Mutually Exclusive Memories
- Ontological Insecurity
- Rise of Warrior narrative(s)
- Securitization of Memory
- Mnemonic Security Dilemma

The Polish Narrative: Poland-Lithuania in 1648



Partition

Partitioned in Late 1700s—Between Three Empires

Rise of Nationalism—Identity Defined in Part by Nobility

Emphasis on Catholic Church



Interwar

Independence and the Defeat of the Bolsheviks

Constitutional Beginnings Degrade into:

Right-Wing Nationalist Authoritarianism

Legal Discrimination against Jews and

Ukrainians

The War Experience

Divided by Germany and Soviet Union

Elites murdered under both regimes--Katyn

Deportations in East and West

Atrocities not seen in France, Denmark, Holland, Belgium,

General Plan Ost

The Holocaust

Polish Traditions of Resistance

Against Prussia, Russia

1794, 1830, 1863

Against the Nazis

Home Army

Ghetto Uprising,

Warsaw Uprising

Against the Communists

1956, 1968, 1970, 1976

Solidarity, 1980

The Polish Martyr Narrative Among Post-Communist Right

POLAND AS VICTIM

POLAND AS SACRED: The Christ of Nations

SACRIFICE IS ENNOBLING



Relations Between Christians and Jews in Poland

- Sigismund the Great
- Interwar Period: Strong Polish Antisemitism
- During the war
 - Holocaust happens in Poland
 - Severe penalties for helping Jews
 - Many Christians benefited from turning in Jews
 - Many Christian Poles helped Jews, but most did not
- Communist Regime largely ignored Holocaust or folded it into anti-fascism
- 2001: The Publication of Neighbors
- Late 1990s-Early 2010s: Limited Revival of Jewish Life, Discussion

Current Government Institutionalizing a Narrative that Defends the Good Name of Poland

The Institute for National Remembrance (IPN)—Only crimes against Poles by Nazis and Soviet

The Museum of World War II—Had been designed as cosmopolitan history
Law and Justice Party criticism: Too many victims, too little heroism
Director Changed

Ulma Family Museum: Commemorating death of rescuers at Nazi hands

2018 Amendment to Memory Law includes: “whoever publicly and contrary to the facts attributes to the Polish Nation or the Polish State responsibility or co-responsibility for Nazi crimes committed by the German Third Reich”

Except in the “framework of artistic or scientific activity”

Polish-Russian Divide

- Molotov-Ribbentrop Pact and The Secret Protocol—1939
 - The Polish Account:
 - Soviet Union and Nazi Germany divide Poland
 - Aggression by Totalitarian countries
 - Soviet Union just as bad as Nazis
 - Russian regime account:
 - Defensive Action by Stalin after West rejected cooperation
 - West abandoned Czechoslovakia, tried to push war eastward
 - Poland not innocent: anti-Semitism, taking part of Czechoslovakia as well
- Katyn- The Murder of 20,000 Polish Officers, Elites
 - Soviets blame Germans
 - Persist in lie until 1989
 - Poles say attempt at decapitating Polish society
- Katyn 2010
- Several attempts at reconciliation, all failed

The 2019 Dispute

- The European Parliament Resolution:
- “The European Parliament...”
- 1. Recalls that, as enshrined in Article 2 of the TEU, the Union is founded on the values of respect for human dignity, freedom, democracy, equality, the rule of law and respect for human rights, including the rights of persons belonging to minorities; recalls that these values are common to all Member States;
- 2. Stresses that the Second World War, the most devastating war in Europe’s history, was started as an immediate result of the notorious Nazi-Soviet Treaty on Non-Aggression of 23 August 1939, also known as the Molotov-Ribbentrop Pact, and its secret protocols, whereby two totalitarian regimes that shared the goal of world conquest divided Europe into two zones of influence;
- 3. Recalls that the Nazi and communist regimes carried out mass murders, genocide and deportations and caused a loss of life and freedom in the 20th century on a scale unseen in human history, and recalls the horrific crime of the Holocaust perpetrated by the Nazi regime; condemns in the strongest terms the acts of aggression, crimes against humanity and mass human rights violations perpetrated by the Nazi, communist and other totalitarian regimes;

Putin's Response

- I believe that such 'paperwork' – for I cannot call this resolution a document – which is clearly intended to provoke a scandal, is fraught with real and dangerous threats. Indeed, it was adopted by a highly respectable institution. And what did it show? Regrettably, it revealed a deliberate policy aimed at destroying the post-war world order whose creation was a matter of honour and responsibility for the countries a number of representatives of which voted today in favour of this deceitful resolution. ...And those who deliberately put this consensus into question undermine the foundations of the entire post-war Europe.

- The creation of the modern system of international relations is one of the major outcomes of World War II. Even the most insurmountable contradictions – geopolitical, ideological, economic – do not prevent us from finding forms of peaceful coexistence and interaction, if there is the desire and will to do so. Today the world is going through quite a turbulent time. Everything is changing, from the global balance of power and influence to the social, economic and technological foundations of societies, nations and even continents. In the past epochs, shifts of such magnitude have almost never happened without major military conflicts. Without a power struggle to build a new global hierarchy. Thanks to the wisdom and farsightedness of the political figures of the Allied Powers, it was possible to create a system that has restrained from extreme manifestations of such objective competition, historically inherent in the world development.



Pre-Nationalism

- Kyivan Rus' --Vikings
- Vladimir the Great—Conversion to Christianity 988
- The Mongol and Division of Eastern Slavs
- 14th Century ---18th Centuries: Ukraine usually not unified,
 - Parts ruled by Lithuanian-Polish, Cossack Hetmanate, Russia, Crimean Tatars
- Late 18th Century: The Partition of Poland and the First Annexation of Crimea
 - Most of Ukraine Becomes Part of Russia, but Western Ukraine part of Austria



19th centuries

Two Approaches to Ukrainian populations

Russian Empire: Ukraine = “Little Russians”

Russification, No Mass Education

Austro-Hungarian Empire—Mass Education

In Local Languages

In Western Ukraine: Poles Dominate Cities,
Ukrainians more rural



20th Century

- World War I and Russian Civil War
 - Groups of Ukrainian nationalists sided with Poles against Bolsheviks
 - But Poles did not want to recognize Ukrainian independence either
- The Early Soviet Ukraine
 - SSR in 1922
 - 1920s Korenizatsia
- Stalin
 - 1930s. Collectivization
 - Campaign against "bourgeois nationalists"
 - Russification
 - Russians sent to work in E. Ukr,
 - The War—Germans invade; Stories that Ukr.
 - Soviets come back
- Post-Stalin:
 - Assimilation, Russian is key language

Polish Galicia
Poles dominant
Discrimination

Mid-Late 1930s: Discrimination

Violent Nationalist Movements

Stepan Bandera; Roman Shukhevych

1939—Soviets invade, Bandera joins Nazis

1941. Germans invade, Bandera goes to camps

Nationalist groups often work with Nazis

1944. Civil war: Poles-Ukrainians

1945. Sovietization





Independent Ukraine

- 1987-1991: Ukrainian Nationalist Movement in West, then spreads
- 1991: Yuriy Kravchenko, Former head of secret police and First Party Secretary, becomes First President.
 - Referendum: More than 90% for independence
- Kravchenko's and Kuchma's Presidency (1991-2004)
 - Fairly superficial reforms
 - Patronal networks tied to Russian economy
 - Recognizes nationalism, but downplays differences, looks to future
- 2004. The Orange Revolution
 - Yushchenko—Ukrainian Nationalist
 - Yanukovich-Embedded in oligarchic networks with Russia

2010 Yanukovich wins-fair Elections

2014: Partnership with EU or membership in Russia's Eurasian Economic Union

Maidan protests

Corruption a Key Issue

In a truncated Ukraine, Russian interests diminish in power

Secretary, becomes First

Ukrainian Identity: Before and After 2014

- Join European Union or Eurasian Economic Union?
 - 2013: 42% for EU, 37% for EAEU
 - 2016: 47% for EU, 16% for EAEU
- Positive Attitudes towards Russia?
 - February 2014: 78% Positive; May 2015: 30% Positive
- Independence Referendum?
 - 2011: 61% for independence; but in East only 53% and in South only 37%
 - 2016: 87% for independence including 71% in East and 78% in South
- HOLODOMOR A GENOCIDE? 2010- 60% said yes; 2017- 80%
- Bandera and others? May 2012—21%; 2013—31%

Ukrainian Memory and Other Laws

2015: Four Decommunization Laws

Remembering Victory over Nazism:

Great Patriotic War to World War II;

Prohibits “falsification of the history of World War II”

Condemning Nazist and Communist Totalitarianism and Symbols

Renaming streets, taking down statues, etc.

Recognition of Fighters of Independence: More Controversial

Also upsets Poles

2019: De-Russification Laws

The 2012 Law-Ukrainian state language but regions can declare Russian a minority language and use in governmental business, schools

2019 limits use of Russian throughout public life, including education and the media

Restrictions of Russian books sold in Ukraine

Restrictions of Russian movies, television available in Ukraine

Putin Denies Existence of Ukrainian Nation

- It should be noted that Ukraine actually never had stable traditions of real statehood. And, therefore, in 1991 it opted for mindlessly emulating foreign models, which have no relation to history or Ukrainian realities.
- I will start with the fact that modern Ukraine was entirely created by Russia or, to be more precise, by Bolshevik, Communist Russia. This process started practically right after the 1917 revolution, and Lenin and his associates did it in a way that was extremely harsh on Russia – by separating, severing what is historically Russian land. Nobody asked the millions of people living there what they thought.
- Lenin ... suggested making concessions to the nationalists, whom he called “independents” at that time. Lenin’s ideas of what amounted in essence to a confederative state arrangement and a slogan about the right of nations to self-determination, up to secession, were laid in the foundation of Soviet statehood.
- If Ukraine does not exist but is part of Russia, then all people who fight for Ukrainian independence are Nazis like Bandera

Debates Over Different Laws

- CRITIQUES

- Expensive
- Freedom of speech
- Human Rights

- DEFENSE

- National Security
 - Russia's Hybrid War
 - Possibility of infiltration, subversion
- Economic Development
 - Russia has a huge market, can produce books, movies, etc on a larger scale
- Decolonization—Persistent efforts of Russification have to be undone