

Lecture 5

Types of nationalism and nation-
building

Culture or politics?

- Is N about culture or politics?
- This question stands at the heart of a heated debate on the nature of N

- N is about politics:

- N is primarily a political ideal
- N wants independent state (or at least political autonomy)
- National identity is political identity connected to the political community
- Political N - mass national movement for national independence and creation of state

- N is about culture:

- National claims are not necessarily claims for political sovereignty
- N can be about the right to preserve the existence of a nation as a distinct cultural entity
- Cultural N – elevation of national consciousness and national agitation for greater national autonomy

Two types of N?

- CIVIC N (also termed political, voluntary, individualistic, ...)
- ETHNIC N (also termed cultural, organic, collectivistic, ...)
- Other typologies have also been suggested (Hechter distinguishes between state-building, peripheral, irredentist and unification N; Brubaker suggests nationalising, transborder, autonomist N; etc.)

‘West’ & ‘East’

- ‘West’ vs. ‘the rest’
- Hans Kohn’s distinction between Western and Eastern forms of nationalism (mainly based on geographical criteria)
- This classical classification was revived in the post-1989 period; ‘resurgence’ of N in Europe

Hence...

- West
 - Political
 - Civic
 - Western Europe
 - liberal
 - etc.
- East
 - Cultural
 - Ethnic
 - Central-Eastern
Europe (Asia, ...)
 - illiberal
 - etc.

Criteria of membership

- **Civic N:** shared commitment to public institutions of the state and civil society
- Membership in the nation (supposedly) voluntary
- **Ethnic N:** emphasis on common descent
- Membership exclusive

Because...

- Different experiences and developments between Western and Eastern Europe (not to mention ‘the rest of the world’)
- West: relatively strong and stable national identities (18th – 20th century)
- CEE: much more conflict over what constitutes a nation; N became equated with ‘problems’

Nation-building

- *State-to-nation* model of the ‘old continuous nations’ (top-down model)
- *Nation-to-state* model of cultural nations, stateless nations (community-based view ‘from below’)

Nation-building in history

- The ‘old, continuous’ nations and nationalisms of the 18th century (examples of Britain, France, Spain)
- The romantic nationalists and nationalisms of the 19th century (examples of the unification of Italy, Germany)
- The ‘non-dominant ethnic groups’ or ‘small’ or ‘stateless’ nations and nationalisms of the 20th century

Normative implications

- Civic as *good* vs. ethnic as *bad*
- Because from the 1780s to the 1870s N meant a liberal, cosmopolitan discourse emphasising the freedom of all peoples
- Distinction between morally acceptable N and dangerous, immoral forms of N (see also distinctions between patriotism and nationalism)
- Opposition between ‘Western’ patriotism (seen as benign, integrative) & populist ‘Eastern’ nationalism (emotionally disruptive)

Problems

- N is about both – culture and politics
- All national identities are exclusionary
- Even F and USA have cultural component (history of F; USA - why learn English and American history?)
- Continue to use as ideal-types?

Next week's readings:

- John Breuilly “The Sources of Nationalist Ideology” in Hutchinson & Smith (1994) *Nationalism* pp. 103- 113.
- Connor, Walker (1994): *Ethnonationalism* pp. 39-42.
- Ernest Gellner “Nationalism and Modernization” & “N and High Cultures” in Hutchinson & Smith (1994) *Nationalism* pp. 55-70.
- Anthony Giddens “The Nation as Power-Container” in Hutchinson & Smith (1994) *Nationalism* pp. 34-35.
- Weber, Eugen (1976): *Peasants into Frenchmen*