



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS
Advancing Knowledge, Driving Change

Beethoven and the New Development-Theme in Sonata-Form Movements

Author(s): Bathia Churgin

Source: *The Journal of Musicology*, Summer, 1998, Vol. 16, No. 3, New Perspectives on Beethoven Sources and Style (Summer, 1998), pp. 323-343

Published by: University of California Press

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/763994>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



University of California Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of Musicology*

JSTOR

°Beethoven and the New Development-Theme in Sonata-Form Movements

BATHIA CHURGIN

323
—

A well-known feature of the development section in Beethoven's *Eroica* Symphony, first movement, is the prominent new theme. This was not a novel effect, however, for in Classic music the introduction of a new theme in the development, or, more accurately, new developmental material is an old device. What is new about the *Eroica's* new theme is its dramatic and dissonant preparation, the extremely remote key in which it first appears—e minor, enharmonically the minor Neapolitan of the tonic E♭ major—and the five-fold repetition of the theme.¹ Three presentations occur in the development, each beginning in a different key—e minor, a minor, and e♭ minor, and two near the start of the long coda, in the keys of f minor—the normal second degree—and again in e♭ minor (the theme begins in mm. 284, 292, 322, 581, and 589). This quintessential example of a new development-theme will be our paradigm against which we can measure other such examples.

If we examine the tradition in which Beethoven composed, we find that new themes, phrases, motives, and figurations (which I will designate as N) occur in the development section of sonata-form movements from the earliest phase of the Classic period onward. For example, such ideas appear before 1740 in many movements of early symphonies by G. B. Sammartini and Antonio Brioschi. In first movements of two Sammartini symphonies, J-C 7 and 65, the composer introduces distinctive

Volume XVI • Number 3 • Summer 1998
The Journal of Musicology © 1998 by the Regents of the University of California

¹ Because of the many references to keys in this survey, major keys are indicated by capital letters and minor keys by lower-case letters. Lower-case Roman numerals stand for minor chords or key relationships.

EXAMPLE 1. G. B. Sammartini, Symphony in C Major, J-C 7/I: cadential theme (K) and start of the development with 1N.

324

The musical score is presented in three systems, each with four staves: Violin I (Vn. I), Violin II (Vn. II), Viola (Vla.), and Violoncello/Bass (Vc. B.).

- System 1 (Measures 41-44):** Labeled with a boxed 'K' above measure 41. The first staff (Vn. I) begins with a melodic phrase marked 'm' (melody). The second staff (Vn. II) has a whole rest in measure 41, then enters with a rhythmic accompaniment. The third staff (Vla.) and fourth staff (Vc. B.) provide a steady rhythmic accompaniment.
- System 2 (Measures 45-48):** Labeled with a boxed '1N' above measure 45. The first staff (Vn. I) features a melodic line with trills in measures 47 and 48. The second staff (Vn. II) continues the rhythmic accompaniment. The third staff (Vla.) and fourth staff (Vc. B.) continue the accompaniment. A 'p' (piano) dynamic marking is present in measure 47. A 'bass motive' is indicated in the bass staff in measure 48, marked with 'p' and 'm¹'.
- System 3 (Measures 49-52):** The first staff (Vn. I) continues the melodic line with trills. The second staff (Vn. II) continues the rhythmic accompaniment. The third staff (Vla.) and fourth staff (Vc. B.) continue the accompaniment.

themes, the more significant ones in one of the earliest and best Sammartini symphonies, J-C 7 in C major, probably composed by 1730 (Example 1).²

Here, two new themes are placed in the key of the mediant—minor—a fairly remote key for Sammartini. 1N is 18 mm. long and 2N 8 mm. Like many later N themes, these themes contain both new and derived elements, the second theme also related to the first. In 1N, a derived motive (here, a bass motive) accompanies the theme as well, a technique later found in some Beethoven N themes (see Example 5). The bass motive returns at the start of the recapitulation combined with the cadential (K) theme, from which it most closely derives. In addition, 2N comes back in the recapitulation in the tonic minor. The recurrence of a new theme or idea in the recapitulation thus has a long history.

The use of new material in the development may reflect the influence of the B section of the da capo aria, as Leonard Ratner suggests.³ Recall of such material in the recapitulation may well stem from a similar procedure found in late Baroque concerto movements in ritornello form, which often incorporate ideas presented later in the movement in a final recapitulation section.⁴

That the development can contain new material should not surprise us since Classic sonata form is basically a tonal, not a thematic plan. New material in this section has many functions, such as contrast, surprise, enrichment, intensification, and structural articulation. Obviously, each example of new material must be studied individually in order to comprehend fully its role in the movement's structure.

Theorists like Koch, Galeazzi, Reicha, and Czerny all mention the possibility of introducing a new theme or idea, first of all at the opening of Part II of a sonata-form movement. Galeazzi (1796) specifies such new themes as one of the standard options at this point in the

² For the score and analysis of J-C 7, see my edition, Giovanni Battista Sammartini, *Ten Symphonies*, "The Symphony, 1720–1840," ed. Barry S. Brook, Series A, vol. 2 (New York and London, 1984), Score 1. The Symphony J-C 65 (dated before 1738) is published in my edition, *The Symphonies of G. B. Sammartini. Volume I: The Early Symphonies* (Cambridge, MA, 1968), No. 16 in the volume). For new developmental material in all three movements of Brioschi's symphony in G, Fonds Blancheton 32 (dated before October 1733), see my edition and analysis in "The Symphony, 1720–1840," Series A, vol. 3 (1985), Score 1.

³ Leonard G. Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (New York, 1980), 229, 233.

⁴ Examples can be found in Antonio Vivaldi's Concerto, Op. 3 No. 8/III (pub. 1711), where a variant of the modulatory Solo 2 moving from a to e (mm. 35–50) returns in the tonic near the end of the movement (mm. 132–41); and in J. S. Bach's Italian Concerto/III (1735), where new material in F–B \flat (mm. 77–84) returns in the reprise section in B \flat –C–F (mm. 155–66).

structure,⁵ while Koch (1793) states that the device is common only in the concerto.⁶ Much later, Czerny (1848?) broadens the possibility and observes that in the first section of Part II “the ideas of the first part must be displayed, developed, worked up, and necessarily augmented with new ones.”⁷ Reicha’s remarks (c. 1825) are both more far reaching and more specific. He indicates that at the start of Part II, a new theme can be 8–16 mm. long and be developed together with earlier ideas. New ideas can be further introduced in Part II and especially in the coda.⁸

After about 1740, new themes in symphonic allegros, especially first movements, usually occur at the beginning of Part II, as described much later by the theorists. Such themes are often cantabile and *piano*, providing lyrical and broader rhythmic contrasts otherwise lacking in the movement. These themes may also be imitative, or feature the winds; they may remain in the second key or be modulatory; and they may have some derived material or figures. In all such cases, the change in theme, rhythm, dynamics, texture, orchestration, and expression strongly articulate the start of Part II and what we call the development section.⁹ Sometimes new themes also end the section, functioning as the retransition. Many early Classic modulation sections offer largely or entirely new material, a feature of many Mozart developments even into the early 1780s.¹⁰ Perhaps the most famous N theme besides the *Eroica* theme is the minuet-like lyrical interlude closing the development of Haydn’s Symphony No. 45 (the “Farewell”), first movement (1772), recently the subject of detailed analysis and debate.¹¹

⁵ See my article, “Francesco Galeazzi’s Description (1796) of Sonata Form,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* XXI (1968), 195. Galeazzi recommends that the N theme “for greatest surprise . . . be in some related key [not the secondary key], but separated and unexpected.”

⁶ See Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition*, vol. 3 (Leipzig, 1793), par. 150, 395–96n.

⁷ Carl Czerny, *Practical School of Composition*, Op. 600, trans. John Bishop, vol. 1 (London, 1848?), Ch. VI, “Of the Sonata,” 35.

⁸ Antoine Reicha, *Traité de haut composition musicale*, vol. 2 (Paris, c. 1825), 298 (“De la seconde partie de la grand coup binaire”). Beethoven’s codas also introduce N ideas, as Reicha recommends, the most famous examples perhaps being the N ideas in the codas of the Ninth Symphony, movements I and III.

⁹ Such N themes appear in one or two sonata-form movements in all the middle and late symphonies by Sammartini in my Garland volume, the symphonies dating from the 1740s to 1772.

¹⁰ A late example is the development in Mozart’s Piano Sonata in C, K. 330/I, now dated 1781–83.

¹¹ See Judith L. Schwartz, “Periodicity and Passion in the First Movement of Haydn’s ‘Farewell’ Symphony,” and James Webster, “The D Major Interlude in the First Movement of Haydn’s ‘Farewell’ Symphony,” in *Studies in Musical Sources and Style. Essays in Honor of Jan LaRue*, ed. Eugene K. Wolf and Edward H. Roesner (Madison, WI, 1990), 293–338 and 339–80.

When we consider Beethoven's exploitation of this long-standing device, we discover that he both follows and departs from traditional usage. I have focused this survey on the piano, violin, and cello sonatas, the string quartets, the String Quintet Op. 29, the concertos, and the symphonies, a total of 80 works. Of these, 40—one-half—incorporate significant new material in the development sections of sonata-form movements. This high percentage comes as a surprise since the emphasis of analysts has been on Beethoven's use of derived material rather than new material in the development section. The survey shows the employment of new material is a major Beethoven technique that requires further study.

Though N material appears in music composed throughout Beethoven's life, the most striking and frequent examples are especially characteristic of the early period and the early middle period through 1806. They disappear from the piano sonatas after Op. 14/1 (written in 1798) except for the two special finales of Opp. 54 and 57 (dated 1804–06). Rather than the symphonies and sonatas, it is in the string quartets that the procedure is most tenacious, occurring in almost all of the Op. 18 and Op. 59 quartets and four of the last five quartets (1824–26), including the second finale of Op. 130, Beethoven's last completed movement.¹² (See the list of works containing N material in Table I.)

Beethoven also occasionally introduces two or more N themes or ideas in the development, like the two lyrical N themes in the Violin Sonata Op. 23/I, the two contrapuntal ideas in the Quartet Op. 131/VII, or the long, episode-like N section of the Quartet Op. 130/VI, enriched by four distinctive themes (see Example 2). Beethoven's awareness of this device is illustrated by his well-known remark after a sketch for the beginning of Part II of the Piano Sonata Op. 14/1/I: "ohne das The[ma] durchzuführen"—"without developing the theme."¹³

The works analyzed embody several types of new ideas. The largest categories consist of the traditional lyrical theme, which is the most common type, and contrapuntal ideas. Examples of the lyrical type occur in 24 movements. Many are modulating, and start or remain in the minor mode, as in the *Eroica*. Besides the *Eroica* theme, there are memorable, often long lyrical themes in such works as the Piano Sonatas Op. 2/1/IV, Op. 10/1/I, Op. 14/1/I; the first movements of the Violin Sonatas Op. 23 and Op. 30/2; the Third Piano Concerto and the Violin Concerto (see Example 5); and the Quartet Op. 59/1/III.

¹² All references to Op. 130/VI are to the second finale of the quartet.

¹³ See Ludwig van Beethoven, *Autograph Miscellany From circa 1786 to 1799*, British Museum Additional Manuscript 29801, ff. 39–162 (The "Kafka Sketchbook"), ed. Joseph Kerman, vol. 2, Transcription (London, 1970), 28.

TABLE 1

Overview of New Material in Sonata-Form Developments Found
in Beethoven's Piano, Violin, and Cello Sonatas, String Quartets,
String Quintet Op. 29, Concertos, and Symphonies

EARLY PERIOD: c. 1793–1800

Piano Sonatas, c. 1793–98: Op. 2/1/IV and 3/I; Op. 7/I; Op. 10/1/I, 2/I, 3/II;
Op. 14/1/I; Op. 49/1/I

Violin Sonatas, 1797–1800: Op. 12/3/I, Op. 23/I

Cello Sonatas, 1796: Op. 5/1/I, 2/I

String Quartets, 1798–1800: Op. 18/1/II; 2/I, IV; 3/IV; 6/I

Concertos, 1795? (rev. 1800), 1800?: Piano Concertos No. 1 Op. 15/I; No. 3
Op. 37/I

MIDDLE PERIOD: 1801–09

Piano Sonatas, 1804–06: Op. 54/II, Op. 57/III

Violin Sonatas, 1801–02: Op. 30/2/I, Op. 47/III

String Quartets, 1806: Op. 59/1, III; 2/II; 3/I, II, IV

String Quintet, 1801: Op. 29/II, IV

328

Concertos, ca. 1803–09: Piano Concertos No. 4 Op. 58/I; No. 5 Op. 73/I; Violin
Concerto Op. 61/I; Triple Concerto Op. 56/I

Symphonies 1801–08: No. 2 Op. 36/I; No. 3 Op. 55/I; No. 4, Op. 60/I; No. 6
Op. 68/II

LATE PERIOD: 1815–26

Cello Sonatas, 1815: Op. 102/1/II, 2/I

String Quartets, 1824–26: Op. 127/I; Op. 130/I, III, VI (2nd finale); Op. 131/VII;
Op. 135/I

A special type of lyrical N resembles a rondo episode and occurs at or near the start of the development of three finales that synthesize sonata and rondo procedures without actually being sonata-rondos. The movements involved are in the Piano Sonatas Op. 2/1 and Op. 57, and the Quartet Op. 130. These themes, as usual in the rondo style, feature largely symmetrical units of four and eight measures. Two themes, in Op. 2/1 and Op. 130, are extremely long. The N unit in Op. 2/1 is 50½ measures (mm. 59–109) and organized in rounded binary form with varied repeats. It appears in A♭ major, the relative major of the tonic f minor, a key Beethoven studiously avoids in an exposition that moves to the dominant minor instead. In Op. 130, a lyrical and contrapuntal section of 47 measures also appears in A♭, here the key of ♭VII

(mm. 109–55; see Ex. 2). The key of A \flat and the melodic line in 3N relate to the *Grosse Fuge*, the original finale of the quartet, and lyricism is otherwise lacking in the movement. Unlike the other examples, the entire episode returns in the coda in the subdominant and tonic keys by way of recapitulation (mm. 353–99).

The contrapuntal category of N ideas comprises new subjects for fugal or quasi-fugal and imitative passages, and new countersubjects against derived ideas. New fugue subjects are explored in the Quintet Op. 29/IV (Ex. 3) and in the first movements of the Quartets Op. 18/2, Op. 59/1, and Op. 135; and new countersubjects and cantus-firmus-like material in the Quintet Op. 29/IV, and the Quartets Op. 18/3/IV, Op. 59/2/II, Op. 127/I, and Op. 131/VII. Other categories involve motivic ideas, like the stormy counter motive in the Quartet Op. 18/1/II (see Ex. 4); new figural material, especially in the Piano Concertos Nos. One Op. 15 and Five Op. 73, first movements; chromatic passages, as in the Piano Sonatas Op. 2/3/I and Op. 54/II, and the Cello Sonata Op. 5/1/I; and humorous but formal melody in the Quintet Op. 29/IV.

Moreover, Beethoven varies the placement of his N material, which can be located at any point in the development. The traditional lyrical theme starting Part II, however, is less favored and occurs in only six movements—the Piano Sonatas Op. 2/1/IV and Op. 10/3/II, the Quintet Op. 29/II, the Violin Sonata Op. 30/2/I, the Triple Concerto Op. 56/I, and the Quartet Op. 130/VI—in addition to four examples of significant motives and phrases in the Quartet Op. 18/1/II, the Sixth Symphony Op. 68/II (goldfinch motive),¹⁴ and the Cello Sonatas Op. 102/1/II and Op. 102/2/I. Three of these follow brief transitions to the development proper, as does the fugal section in Op. 29/IV. Other themes or new material come fairly close to the opening of the development, after a citation or development of the primary or other themes, as in the Piano Sonatas Op. 2/3/I and Op. 10/1/I, the Third Piano Concerto Op. 37/I, the Fourth Symphony Op. 60/I, and the Quartets Op. 130/I and Op. 131/VII. A group of N themes enters toward the middle or second part of the development, like the *Eroica* theme, as in the Cello Sonata Op. 5/2/I, the Quartet Op. 59/1/I, III, the Violin Concerto Op. 61/I, or the second countersubject in the Quartet Op. 131/VII. On the other hand, some material emerges dramatically near or at the end of the development usually functioning as the retransition. Such striking examples are the N units in the Cello Sonata Op. 5/1/I, the Violin Sonatas Op. 12/3/I and Op. 23/I, and the

¹⁴ For the identification of the bird as a goldfinch rather than a yellow hammer, see Owen Jander, "The Prophetic Conversation in Beethoven's 'Scene by the Brook,'" *The Musical Quarterly* LXXVII (1993), 518–21.

THE JOURNAL OF MUSICOLOGY

EXAMPLE 2. Beethoven, String Quartet, Op. 130/VI, development:
episode-like N section.

109 **1N**

Vn. I
Vn. II
Vla.
Vc.

cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*

330

117 **1N¹**

cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *cresc.* *p*

125 **2N** **3N + 2N**

cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p* *cresc.*
cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*
cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*

EXAMPLE 2. (continued)

133

cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*

dim. *cresc.* *p*

cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*

cresc. *dim.* *cresc.* *p*

4N

140

p cresc. *p* *cresc.* *p* *pp*

p *cresc.* *p* *pp*

p cresc. *p* *pp*

p cresc. *p* *pp*

4N¹

148

cresc. *p*

cresc. *p*

cresc. *p*

cresc. *p*

Quintet Op. 29/IV; only in the case of Op. 29 does the N theme, in a distant key, require a brief retransition to the recapitulation.

In most cases N themes possess a distinctive outline and character, though they may incorporate some derived elements. Thus the *Eroica* theme takes the dotted rhythm from the first secondary theme (which is emphasized in the buildup to the N theme), and many analysts have tried to prove its triadic connection to the primary theme.¹⁵ The fugue subject in the Quartet Op. 59/1/I features a rising sixth, also found in the two primary themes, while in the Quartet Op. 130/VI, 1N utilizes a neighbor-note figure appearing in the primary and transitional themes. Nevertheless, N ideas may bring material for which little or no derivation can be discovered—like the thirty-second note pattern of the countermotive in the Quartet Op. 18/1/II, or the dotted, march-like rhythm of the fugue subject and the syncopation of its countersubject in the Quintet Op. 29/IV. Both ideas assume a new $\frac{2}{4}$ meter versus the $\frac{6}{8}$ meter of the movement that continues in other voices (Example 3). In this case, the dotted rhythm links the fugue with the humorous third N theme ending the development in a slower tempo, the *Andante con moto e scherzoso*, in yet another meter— $\frac{3}{4}$.¹⁶

332

Some N ideas are borderline cases and analysts may prefer to consider them transformations or derivations rather than N ideas. This may be the case, for example, regarding the lyrical 2N in the Fourth Piano Concerto Op. 58/I (mm. 231–35). The phrase can be thought of as a transformation of the introductory descending scale idea that dominates the first part of the development (mm. 196–215), though 2N is preceded not by that idea directly but by a brilliant, cadential 1N unit that establishes the tritone key of c# minor in which the lyrical 2N arrives.¹⁷

¹⁵ See the example in Lawrence Earp, "Tovey's 'Cloud' in the First Movement of the *Eroica*. An Analysis Based on the Sketches for the Development and Coda," *Beethoven Forum* II (1993), 74, and references in n. 10 to such an interpretation by August Halm, "Die fremdkörper im ersten Satz der *Eroica*," *Die Musik* XXI (1928/29), 481–85; Heinrich Schenker, "Beethovens Dritte Sinfonie zum erstenmal in ihrem wahren Inhalt dargestellt," in *Das Meisterwerk in der Musik* III (Munich, 1930), 50, fig. 24 and Bild 1; and David Epstein, *Beyond Orpheus: Studies in Musical Structure* (Cambridge, MA, 1979), 116.

¹⁶ The interpolation of a new section in a slower tempo is an influence of the *da capo* overture. See my article, "The Italian Symphonic Background to Haydn's Early Symphonies and Opera Overtures," in *Haydn Studies, Proceedings of the International Haydn Conference, Washington, D.C., 1975*, ed. Jens Peter Larsen, Howard Serwer, and James Webster (New York and London, 1981), 331–32; and the revised reprint in *Orbis Musicae* XII (1998), 75–76, and n. 12.

¹⁷ Another borderline case is the *cantus-firmus*-like descending tetrachord and its extension in the Quartet Op. 127/I, first found in mm. 89–93, with a balancing phrase, mm. 93, beat 3–97, beat 1. The descending line is closely related to the similar bass line and melodic outline, moving in parallel tenths, in the first phrase of the primary theme (mm. 7–10), where the fourth note, however, moves up by step. The descending tetrachord itself appears in the melodic outline of the second phrase (mm. 11–14). Yet, this N idea has an identity of its own, and it returns in the coda as well, at its start (mm. 241–44), its climax (mm. 267–71), and its end (viola mm. 275–82).

EXAMPLE 3. Beethoven, String Quintet, Op. 29/IV, development: new fugue subject (1N) and countersubject (2N).

Musical score for measures 112-115. The score is for five instruments: Vn. I, Vn. II, Vla. I, Vla. II, and Vc. Measure 112 shows the first violin (Vla. I) playing the new fugue subject (1N) and the second violin (Vn. II) playing the countersubject (2N). Dynamics include *p* and *fp*.

Musical score for measures 116-120. The score continues with the fugue subject and countersubject in various instruments. Dynamics include *p*, *sfp*, and *p*.

Musical score for measures 121-125. The score continues with the fugue subject and countersubject in various instruments. Dynamics include *p* and *sfp*.

Another, remarkable transformation marks the development of the Fourth Symphony Op. 60/I (mm. 221–40), where the new lyrical phrase is actually a variation of the assertive, cantus-firmus-like phrase of the second transitional period (starting in m. 81).¹⁸ Nevertheless, this remains a characteristic N idea that introduces a notable contrast in the section.

As in the *Eroica*, Beethoven presents 24 N themes in remote keys, thus pairing the concept of new material with distance in tonality (see Table 2). In c. 1795–1801, seven such examples show the way to the *Eroica* (which is dated essentially in 1803), with N material appearing or starting in the keys of \flat III (Op. 2/3/I), the tritone (Op. 7/I) \flat VI (Op. 5/1/I, Op. 12/3/I, Op. 18/2/I), major VI (Op. 29/IV, 3N), and minor vii (Op. 29/II). The *Eroica* N theme also focuses our attention on the Neapolitan key relation, a favorite with Beethoven. The minor Neapolitan recurs only once for the key of N, in the finale of the Quartet Op. 59/3 (C–c \sharp =d \flat), dated 1806, and the normal Neapolitan is the key of 2N in the finale of the Quartet Op. 131, dated 1826 (c \sharp –D). Both examples are post-*Eroica*. However, 2N in the Violin Sonata Op. 23/I, dated 1800, though first heard in the tonic key of a minor after a false retransition, ends up in the Neapolitan key of B \flat major (mm. 152–57) before the tonic is restored to usher in the recapitulation.

In fact, this N theme shares another rare feature with the *Eroica* theme—it receives special emphasis by means of extensive repetition. Like the *Eroica* theme it is heard three times in the development, with two full presentations in the tonic and subdominant, together with a partial repetition in the Neapolitan key just mentioned. Further, the theme's initial phrase returns in the coda, where it is again heard three times, twice in the subdominant and tonic, and a third time in the tonic, with an extension leading to the primary theme that ends the movement.

The recurrence of N in the recapitulation and/or the coda can be found in 15 movements by Beethoven, including this violin sonata and the *Eroica* (see Table 3).¹⁹ Such recurrence, of course, integrates the

¹⁸ See Ludwig Misch, "Ein unbemerkter thematischer Zusammenhang in Beethovens IV. Symphonie," *Die Musikforschung* V (1962), 375–77.

¹⁹ Donald Francis Tovey, article "Sonata Forms," in *Musical Articles from the Encyclopaedia Britannica* (London, 1943), 215–16, mentions examples of a new theme in the development, which he calls an "episode," and he also refers to the possibility of the return of the "episode" in the coda. In the article by Joseph Kerman, "Notes on Beethoven's Codas," in *Beethoven Studies* III, ed. Alan Tyson (Cambridge, 1982), 141–59, and the chapter on the coda in Charles Rosen, *Sonata Forms*, rev. ed. (New York, 1988), 297–352, no mention is made of the return of new material in Beethoven's codas beyond a passing reference to the *Eroica* theme by Kerman (152). Nor is the return of material mentioned in Robert G. Hopkins, "When a Coda is More than a Coda: Reflections on Beethoven," in *Explorations in Music, the Arts, and Ideas. Essays in Honor of Leonard B. Meyer*, ed. Eugene Narmour and Ruth A. Solie (Stuyvesant, NY, 1988), 393–410.

TABLE 2

Distant Keys for the Start of N (in Relation to the Tonic Key)

♭ii	Op. 55, Op. 59/3/IV
♭II	Op. 131 (2N)
II	Op. 54 (PNh—new accompaniment to the primary theme)
♭III	Op. 2/3, Op. 15, Op. 102/1
III	Op. 60, Op. 127, Op. 130/I
iv	Op. 61
tritone	Op. 7, Op. 54 (4N), Op. 58, Op. 59/2, Op. 59/3/II
♭VI	Op. 12/3, Op. 18/2/I, Op. 54 (3N)
VI	Op. 29/IV, Op. 68/II
♭VII	Op. 130/VI
♭vii	Op. 59/1/I
vii	Op. 29/II

TABLE 3

Recall of N Material in the Recapitulation and/or Coda
(in the Tonic Key Unless Otherwise Specified)

335

Op. 2/3:	coda, N variant (♭VI–I)
Op. 10/3:	coda
Op. 18/1:	recap and coda
Op. 23:	coda, 2N (iv–i)
Op. 29/II:	coda, 1N, 2N (iv–I); mvt. IV, coda, 3N
Op. 30/2:	coda (I)
Op. 54:	recap, 1N (i), 3N (I–mod.–I), replacing S and K
Op. 55:	coda (ii–i)
Op. 68:	recap
Op. 102/1/II:	coda (♭VI–IV–♭II)
Op. 127:	coda
Op. 130/III:	coda (IV–I–V ⁷ /IV); mvt. VI, coda (IV–I)
Op. 131:	recap, 2N (iv–♭II); coda, 1N, 2N

new material into the larger structure and expressive world of the movement. Two of these examples recall N in the recapitulation and eleven in the coda; two Quartets, Op. 18/1/II and Op. 131/VII, refer to N ideas in both sections. How this material is recalled differs in each example. In the Quartet Op. 18/1 (see Example 4), two variants of the development countermotive to the primary theme combine with the primary theme in the recapitulation (I have labeled them N¹ and N²),

EXAMPLE 4. Beethoven, String Quartet, Op. 18, no. 1/II: (a) development, with N countermotive; (b) recapitulation with N¹ and N²; (c) coda, with all three N forms.

(a)

336

and both return in the coda together with the original version, which itself leads to the shattering climax of the movement—a most dramatic elaboration of the idea.

In the Quintet Op. 29, coda returns occur in both the slow and final movements, the entire Andante section of the finale coming back in the tonic, a recapitulatory effect, as in Op. 130/VI. Six of the works recalling themes in the coda were composed before the *Eroica* and can thus be viewed as significant precedents for this procedure in the symphony (these are Op. 2/3/I, Op. 10/3/II, Op. 18/1/II, Op. 23/I, Op. 29/II, IV, Op. 30/2/I).

While Beethoven's models for these recurrences need considerable research, some immediate models can be found in compositions by

EXAMPLE 4. (continued)

(b)

66

p

f N¹

(*p*)

f

(*p*)

f

(*p*)

f

68

(*p*)

f N²

p

f

p

f

p

f

70

p

p

p

p

EXAMPLE 4. (continued)

(c)

98

N¹

f *fp* *fp* *f*

100

p *p* *fp* *cresc.*

101

N²

f *f* *f* *f*

EXAMPLE 4. (continued)

339

Mozart, as cited by Kerman and Rosen.²⁰ Indeed, Mozart's extensive use of N material furnishes a significant background for Beethoven. Kerman notes the returns of motivic N ideas in the first-movement codas of Mozart's String Quartets K. 458 (the "Hunt"; 1784), and K. 590 (1790). We may add that both ideas conclude the movement, and in K. 590 N first appears in the distant key of \flat VII. We should remember, however, that Haydn's earlier interlude in the "Farewell" symphony is also set in a distant key—D major, a third-relationship with the tonic, $f\sharp$ minor. Rosen points to the lyrical N theme found at the start of Part II in the Piano Sonata in C major, K. 330/I (1781–83), which also rounds off the movement; and to the chromatic N theme that dominates the development and coda of the Two-Piano Sonata in D, K. 448 (1781). Neither author, however, mentions the themes in the finale of Mozart's A-major

²⁰ See Kerman, "Notes on Beethoven's Codas," 142, and Rosen, *Sonata Forms*, 321–22.

Quartet, K. 464 (1785), a work that Beethoven admired and even copied into score.²¹ Here, brief new counterpoints to the primary theme return in the recapitulation and coda, again ending the movement. In addition, Mozart presents a new theme in the middle of the development as a total surprise, a mysterious chorale-like melody in long notes and chordal setting, which is given contrapuntal and developmental expansion.

In conclusion, let us consider the lyrical N theme in Beethoven's Violin Concerto in D major, first movement. The theme comes in the second part of the development after an intensive reworking of the last five notes of the primary theme's initial phrase, a reworking that takes place in the orchestra with figuration in the violin. Thus, the N theme provides relief from the motivic development and deepens the lyricism of the movement, while shifting the spotlight to the soloist. It is certainly one of the great moments in the concerto (see Example 5 for the start of the theme).

In examining this theme, we should notice the following:

1. Though I call it a theme, like many N ideas it is really an N area lasting 26 measures (mm. 331–56), in which a new theme is introduced, extended, varied, and fragmented.
2. The N theme is accompanied throughout in the orchestra by the pervasive tapping motive of the movement. Embedded in the preceding development of those five notes, the motive eventually repeats without pause as tension increases toward the retransition.
3. As many of Beethoven's N themes, the theme enters in minor, here g minor, the same key as the lyrical N theme in the rondo finale. The subdominant key in general acts like the secondary key of the entire work, G major also being the key of the slow movement, and it is associated with most of the intensely lyrical portions of the concerto.
4. The theme, like many N themes, is modulatory, moving from g minor to E♭ major, again the Neapolitan key, and from there to d minor, used as a foil for the brilliant return to the recapitulation in D major.
5. Though the theme seems new, like most N themes it contains some links with earlier material. The rhythmic pattern of its first two measures (mm. 331–32) duplicates the pattern found in the

²¹ Only Beethoven's copy of the second movement has survived. Dated c. 1800, it is housed in Stockholm, Söftelsen Musikkulturens främjande, Collection of Captain Rudolf Nydahl.

EXAMPLE 5. Beethoven, Violin Concerto, Op. 61/I, development: start of the N area.

329

Cor. (D)

VI. pr.

VI.

Vla.

Vc. e B.

341

333

Cor. (D)

VI. pr.

VI.

Vla.

Vc. e B.

EXAMPLE 5. (continued)

337

Fg.

Cor. (D)

cresc.

pp

cresc.

pp

cresc.

pp

cresc.

pp

cresc.

pp

342

341

pp

first transition theme (mm. 18–19); the prominent half steps stem perhaps from the third secondary theme (mm. 65–68); and the poignant sigh motives echo such motives in the primary theme itself.

This theme validates the device of new development material in every aspect.

Bar-Ilan University