

ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT A POST-DEVELOPMENT

Nederveen Pieterse

Readings – ch 7

Development and post-modern turn

- ▣ Since 80s – post-modern turn in development
- ▣ Revolution in development thinking
- ▣ Rethinking of acultural and technocratic thinking opened up to critique from post-modern position

Forsyth

- ▣ Forsyth - *Encyclopedia of International Development* (2005)
- ▣ 1) New historicism, anthropology of institution and post-development – locates development within the larger framework of historical and cultural development
- ▣ 2) institutional politics self-reflexivity and post-structural insights
- ▣ 3) *post-development* – development as out-dated project, radical rejection of development

New historicism

- ▣ New historicism and anthropology of institutions
- ▣ Practices that 'created the Other'
- ▣ Cf Saavy (1952) and Rista (2001).
- ▣ Anthropology of modernity
- ▣ Aim – to deconstruct the cultural and historical practices that have produced Western Modernity

New historicism

- ▣ Escobar Encountering *Development the Making and Unmaking of the Third World* (Escobar, 1995:12).
- ▣ Deconstruction of modernity and its categories that are taken for granted
- ▣ Subsequent claim to universalism,
- ▣ Deconstruction of modern epistemology
- ▣ (Escobar, 1995:12).

Antropology of modernity

- ▣ - historic specificity of modernity,
- ▣ Garner a Lewis – deconstruction of basic assumptions on which project of modernity is based on
- ▣ Uncovering of power relations underlying project of development (Garner, Lewis, 1996:77)
- ▣ Ethnographic approaches uncovering socially and historically shaped forms of practices
- ▣ Practices = knowledge and power

Institutional politics

- ▣ *self-reflexivity and post-structural approaches*
- ▣ *Development* = set of practices and representations
- ▣ Development – forms of *governmentality* (Foucault, cit. podle Forsyth, 2005:457); **gouverner + mentalité = gouvernementalité**
- ▣ Cf Kierseyho a Stokes (2010)
- ▣ Bio-power and governmentality
- ▣ KIERSY, N.; STOKES, D. (2010): Foucault and International Relations : New Critical Engagements (Interventions). London: Routledge.

Institutional politics

- ▣ Institutional analysis strives for value-free approaches
- ▣ The approaches acknowledges the root of development project in modernity but disagree with the solutions offered by post-development
- ▣ Abandonment of thinking and practices of development (Post-development)

Mosse

- ▣ **Mosse - new anthropology – production of knowledge within the framework of international relations, political and historical relations which shape the representations (Mosse, 2005:11).**
 - ▣ **BØÅS, M., MCNEILL, D. (2004): *Global Institutions and Development*, New York: Routledge.**
 - UN and transformation of ideas within the institution
- Cf WB and 'good governance' - lip service

Post-development

- ▣ Development - critique of five decades of Western efforts to bring about economic growth, technical and scientific progress, increase in labour productivity, exploitation of environment and massive industrialization

Post-Development Reader, Rahmena (1998),
Bawtree

Wolfgang Sachs - *Development Dictionary* - (1992).

Post-development

- ▣ 80s – Journal: **Development : Seeds for Change**
- ▣ LA– Esteva, Escobar
- ▣ Indie – Dehli school (Dallmayr)
- ▣ Pakistan – Rahmena, Bawtree, 1998
- ▣ Malasia- Just World Trust

Post-development authors

- ▣ France – Latouche
- ▣ Switzerland – Rist 1997
- ▣ Germany – Sachs 1992
- ▣ Belgium Verhelst, 1990
- ▣ England - Seabrook 1994
- ▣ Ireland – Tucker, 1999
- ▣ Japan – Lummis
- ▣ Ecologic criticism – Mies, Shiva

Escobar

- ▣ **Colonization of reality** - how certain representations become dominant and shape indelibly the ways in which reality is imagined and acted upon
- ▣ Foucault's work on the **dynamics of discourse and power in the representation of social reality,**
- ▣ has been instrumental **in unveiling the mechanisms by which a certain order of discourse produces permissible models of being and thinking while disqualifying and even making other possible**

Said

- ▣ Orientalism
- ▣ Said - orientalism can be discussed and analyzed as the **corporate institution for dealing with the Orient** –
- ▣ by making statements about it, authorizing views of it, describing it, by teaching it, ruling over it: in short, **orientalism as a Western style of for diminishing, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient**

Said (1979:3)

- ▣ My contention is that is that without examining Orientalism as a discourse we cannot possibly understand the **enormously systematic discipline by which european culture was able to manage and even produce the Orient** politically, sociologically, ideologically, scientifically and imaginatively during the post-enlightenment era (Said 1979:3) quoted in (Escobar, 1995:6).
- ▣ The invention of Africa - V. Y. Mudimbe

Escobar

- ▣ Thinking development in terms of discourse - **makes it possible to maintain the focus on domination**
- ▣ possibility of singling out 'development' as an **encompassing cultural space and and at the same time of separating ourselves from it by perceiving it in a totally new forms**

Escobar – representations

- ▣ To see development as a **historically produced discourse entails** examination of why so many countries started to see themselves as underdeveloped
- ▣ And took on the task of un-underdeveloping
- ▣ (Escobar, 1995:6)

Escobar

- ▣ Truman presidential address, point no. IV, deconstruction of the narrative cf Rist, 1997 (2007)
- ▣ In Truman vision, capital, science and technology were the main ingredients that would make this massive revolution possible (Escobar, 1995:5)
- ▣ **Development has achieved the status of certainty in the social imaginary**
- ▣ **Indeed, it seemed impossible to conceptualize social reality in other terms**

Escobar

- ▣ Wherever one looked, one found **the repetitive and omnipresent reality of development governments** designing and implementing ambitious development plans, institutions carrying out development programs
- ▣ Experts of all kinds studying underdevelopment and production theories ad nauseum.
- ▣ (Escobar, 1995:5)

Escobar

- ▣ For what is at stake is the process by which in the history of the modern West, **non-European areas have been systematically organized into , and transformed according to european constructs** (Escobar, 1995:7).
- ▣ This experience as participant observer was made possible by a curious trick, that of elimination from the picture the European observer , in more concrete terms - observing the (colonial) **world as object form a positionthat is invisible and set apart** (Escobar, 1995:7)

Foucault and development

- ▣ Extensions of Foucault work to colonial and postcolonial situations - **Said, Mudimbe, Mohanty, Bhabha**
- ▣ Anthropology's self-critique and renewal during the 80s have also been important in this regard
- ▣ (Escobar, 1995:5)

Mohanty - Under Western Eyes (J. Conrad)

- ▣ Mohanty - refers to the same feature - the situation of who produces knowledge about Third World women
- ▣ Mohanty discovered that women in the Third World women are represented in most feminist literature on development **on as having 'needs' and problems but few choices and no freedoms**

Mohanty

- ▣ This average Third World woman leads an essentially truncated life **based on her feminine gender (read sexually constrained) and her being 'third world'(read ignorant, poor, uneducated, tradition-bound, domestic, family oriented, victimized**
- ▣ In contrast to the (implicit) **self-representation of Western women as educated**, modern having control over their own bodies and sexualities and freedom to make their own decisions (Mohanty, 1991:56)

Mohanty

- ▣ These representations implicitly assume **Western standards as the benchmark against which to measure the situation of Third World women**
- ▣ Result - **paternalistic attitude on the part of Western women, and more generally -** perpetuation of the hegemonic idea of the West superiority
- ▣ Mohanty, reinterpreted by Escobar, 1995:8).

Escobar

- ▣ (Escobar, 1995:12).
- ▣ Make them (discourses) seem as historically peculiar as possible; show how their claims to truth are linked to social practices and have hence become effective forces in the social world (Rabinow, 1986:241)
- ▣ **Development – which discourses create development discourse architecture?**
- ▣ Compare it with Foucaultian approach in *Les mots et les choses*

Escobar (1995)

- ▣ If it's true that there is an **antropological structure (Foucault 1975:198)** that sustains the modern order and its human sciences,
- ▣ Must be investigated to what extent **this structure has also given rise to the regime of development perhaps as a specific mutation of modernity**

Escobars critique of Said

- ▣ **Difference to orientalism** - originated in Homi Bhabha caution that there is always in Said, the suggestion that colonial power is possessed entirely by the colonizer, given the intentionality and unidirectionality
- ▣ This is a danger - seeks to avoid by considering the variety **of forms with which Third World people resist development interventions and how they struggle to create alternative ways of being and doing** (Escobar, 1995:11).

Brigg

- ▣ BRIGG, M. (2002): Post-development, Foucault and the colonisation metaphor, in: Third World Quarterly, Vol. 23, No. 3, pp. 421-436.
- ▣ Different modality of power in relation to the decolonising countries – one which relies not predominantly on force but on the mobilization (including self-mobilisation) of human subjects and nation-states through the notion of development.
- ▣ As this possibility was progressively realized the relevance of oppositional formulation diminished (Brigg, 2002:424).

Brigg's

- ▣ What we typically recognize as **'power'** is the **coagulation of sets of relations forming a complex strategic situation.**
- ▣ The question of how to make use of such a conceptualization for understanding the postwar development project finds an answer in combining **Foucault's notion of dispositive with a macro-level application of his concept of normalization** (Brigg, 2002:426)

Mehmet (1999)

- ▣ Mehmet (1999) v *Pozápadnění třetího světa, eurocentritě ekonomických rozvojových teorií* argumentuje, že právě rozvoj znamená rozpínání západních norem a institucí na prostor Třetího světa. Post-rozvoj trvá na zásadní reformě celé institucionální architektury (IMF, SB, WTO, OSN - UNPD, regionální organizace, zejména podporující volný obchod), vytvořené k přímo či k nápomoci realizace tohoto projektu.

Sachs

- ▣ Post-development view development as embedded in *neo-colonial constructs*
- ▣ *Key ideological component of global power relations* (Garner, Lewis; 1996:1).
- ▣ Sachs's Development dictionary: A Guide to knowledge as power (1992),
- ▣ Structures of power and structures of knowledge = **production of regimes of truth**

Peet a Hartwick

- ▣ Development 'monopolization of the dream of progress'
- ▣ (Peet, Hartwick, 1999:2),
- ▣ Aggressive in nature
- ▣ Destruction of alternative vision embedded in cultures other than the Western

Vandana Shiva

- ▣ Hierarchy of different types of knowledge
- ▣ (cf Shiva, 1998),
- ▣ Local knowledge subordinate
- ▣ Not only economic but also cultural subordination
- ▣ expansion of ethnocentrism- Western fashion styles and behavior patterns

Vandana Shiva

- ▣ Western knowledge system – marginalization of non-western knowledge system (Escobar, 1995:13).
- ▣ Shiva, V.: Western Science and its Destruction of Local Knowledge, in: Rahnema, M., Bawtree, V. (1998): *The Post-development Reader*. London: Zed Books.
- ▣

Paradox of post-development meta.narrative

- ▣ According to Forsyth (2005:458)
unifying *anti-capitalistic narrative*
- ▣ In which Western institutions IMF, WB
possess hegemonic power
- ▣ Third World – suffers under Western
practices (Third World is **devoid of
agency**)

Post-development and other paradigms

- ▣ Dependency
- ▣ (marxism and structuralism)
- ▣ post-development - of the whole Western project
- ▣ Focus on diversity, primacy of local knowledge and colonial roots of development discourse
- ▣ (Garner, Lewis; 1996:22).

Local and alternative movements

- ▣ Strong points – post-structuralist critique
- ▣ Weakness – alternatives offered
- ▣ Rist, de Sauvy
- ▣ [:http://www.apres-developpement.org/accueil/index_en.php](http://www.apres-developpement.org/accueil/index_en.php).

Participative practices

- ▣ Does less market participation mean automatically greater extent of social participation?
- ▣ (Nederveen Pieterse, 2001).
- ▣ Post-development authors disregard the different currents of mainstream development

Ferguson

- ▣ Ferguson, J. (1990): *The Anti-Politics Machine: 'Development', Depoliticisation, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ▣ Manifest vs. latent functions of development
- ▣ Homogenic apparatus

Escobar critique of Said

- ▣ Discursive determinism
- ▣ (Escobar, 1995).
- ▣ Saïd - discourse analysis based on literary texts
- ▣ But colonial/post-colonial, sub-altern studies
- ▣ Rahmena -

Post-development

- ◎ RIST, G. (1997): *The History of Development, From Western Origin to Global Faith*, London: Zed Books.
- ◎ RAMOMET, I. (1998): The One and Only Way of Thinking. In Rahnema, M., Bawtree, V. (1998): *The Post-development Reader*. London: Zed Books.
- ◎ GANDHI, L. (1998): *Postcolonial Theory: a critical introduction*, Columbia University Press.
- ◎ FORSYTH, T. (ed.) (2005): [Encyclopedia of International Development](#). London and New York: Routledge.
- ◎ COWEN, M. P.; SHENTON, R.W. (1996): *Doctrines of Development*, London and New York: Routledge.